



Black-Letter Methodology in Public Health Research

Arjun Aryal¹

SUMMARY

In comparison to other public health disciplines, such as epidemiology and social sciences, the significance of law in promoting population-level health advances is relatively underutilized and less well-studied. Black-letter methodology, also known as doctrinal research, traditionally used in legal studies, focuses on the systematic analysis of legal texts and statutes. Black-letter methodology indicates the fundamental components of legal study that are not subject to dispute or uncertainty. It is generally recognized by the majority of justices in a specific jurisdiction. The fundamental sources of law, such as legislation, are the focus of the black-letter analysis. In public health, the objective of black-letter methodology is to acquire an understanding of the ways in which the legal determinants, including various laws, procedures, systems, and provisions, affect the health of the people involved. This methodology can be adapted to public health research to examine the impact of laws and regulations on health outcomes. This viewpoint explores the application of the black-letter methodology in public health, highlighting its potential to provide robust insights into the legal determinants of health.

Keywords: Black letter methodology, doctrinal research, public health, legal determinants of health, health, Nepal

INTRODUCTION

Public health is one of the significant disciplines taught in in different universities in the world. In Nepal, the master's degrees related to public health include a Master in Public Health (MPH), Master in Public Health Nutrition (MPHN), and Master in Health Promotion and Education (MHPE), among others, and constitute research methodology and thesis or dissertation as mandatory courses. (1) The epidemiological and social research methodologies are frequently discussed in these public health-related research courses and the thesis or dissertation whereas legal research methodologies are rarely used in public health. In addition to and empirical studies, the black-letter methodology, which is also known as doctrinal studies is frequently used in

legal research. (2, 3) Empirical research methodologies are also incorporated in public health research, but the black-letter research methodology, the powerful and useful research methodology for public health, is usually not practiced in public health research. It is rarely discussed in public health research courses, and hardly appears in the public health thesis or dissertation in our context.

The concept of the black-letter research methodology is explained as the rules that are generally well-known and free from doubt or dispute, as the term black-letter law is associated with the letter-of-the-law, which denotes a court's literal interpretation of the law. The black-letter methodology is a legal study system that simplifies case law from common law societies into reusable rules, which can be applied to

Received on: 10 August 2024
Approved on: 20 August 2024

Check for updates

¹ Central Department of Public Health, Tribhuvan University, Institute of Medicine, Kathmandu, Nepal

Correspondence to:

Arjun Aryal
Central Department of Public Health, Tribhuvan University, Institute of Medicine, Kathmandu, Nepal
Email: drarjunaryal@gmail.com

any set of facts to form consistent outcomes. (3) Black-letter methodology is a research methodology that is frequently implemented in the field of legal studies. It involves the meticulous investigation and analysis of legal sources in order to interpret and understand legal principles, rules, doctrines, and their practical applications. (4) Black-letter methodology, with its emphasis on the detailed analysis of legal texts, offers a structured approach to understanding these legal determinants.

While the black-letter methodology is commonly used in legal disciplines like contract, tort, and property law, its scope should be expanded to study the legal determinants of public health outcomes. Public health research often intersects with legal frameworks, as laws and regulations significantly influence health outcomes. As the black-letter methodology involves the systematic examination of statutes, case law, and legal principles to assess their impact, it is, therefore, paramount to explore the scope and application of black-letter methodology in public health research.

BRIEF HISTORY OF BLACK-LETTER LAW

The concept of black-letter law was developed as a result of the practice of composing legal precedent and law texts in Gothic black-letter type. This was a custom that endured the transition to Roman and italic text for all other printed works. Because it had become synonymous with the law of England, the robust, black Gothic font was maintained in English law. (5) The legal profession did not adopt Roman letters until the mid-19th century. This was not merely a fashion trend; rather, it was an effort to enhance the accessibility of the law for the general populace.

KEY CHARACTERISTICS OF BLACK-LETTER METHODOLOGY

The black-letter methodology can be characterized in the following points: (i) The black-letter methodology in legal research heavily focuses on the law itself as a set of principles accessed through court judgments and statutes, with little reference to external factors; (ii) It involves deriving principles and values from decided cases and organizing them into a coherent framework; (iii) Traditional legal scholarship has followed this approach, emphasizing order, rationality, and theoretical cohesion; (iv) The black-letter methodology is contrasted with non-traditional, interdisciplinary research projects; (v) It relies on using primary and secondary legal sources like court judgments and statutes to explain the law; (vi) Legal research skills taught in this approach include identifying legal context, analyzing legal issues, applying legal provisions to facts, and presenting research findings clearly. (6,7)

APPROACH OF BLACK-LETTER METHODOLOGY

Blackletter law specifically denotes areas of the law that are primarily composed of technical principles, as opposed to areas of the law that are defined by a more conceptual premise. Contracts, torts, and land law are all examples of blackletter law. The black-letter methodology involves several key steps. (4, 5, 6)

Data collection

In contrast to empirical legal research, data acquisition in black-letter methodology is comparable to literature review. It utilizes both primary and secondary data sources. The identification of keywords and the development of review parameters, as well as the sources and methods of information acquisition, are crucial. The library functions as the laboratory for this type of investigation.

Scientific justification

Regrettably, numerous academicians who implement black-letter methodology in their research frequently fail to articulate a transparent and unambiguous rationale for their findings. It is essential to rectify these deficiencies in order to improve the efficacy of legal research. Scholars who are involved in black-letter research methodology should prioritize the development of a structured and rigorous approach for their research in order to address this issue. The process must be rendered more transparent and reproducible by providing a comprehensive articulation of the underlying principles and criteria that guide their analysis. This method not only enhances the credibility of their research but also facilitates the general progress of legal scholarship.

Data analysis

The black-letter research may implement an assortment of analytical methodologies, including the systematic review and interpretation of judicial decisions or case law to deduce insights and conclusions about legal principles, rules, and their application, which is known as case law analysis. The effective contextualization and analysis of identified case laws are ensured by the predefined parameters and keywords.

The social, political, and cultural dynamics that highlight the legislative processes or policy implementation can be revealed by researchers through discourse analysis. It is particularly relevant in the context of political power dynamics involved in the creation and execution of law, as it is instrumental in discerning not only the overt content but also the covert notions, underlying assumptions, ideologies, and meanings.

In the field of legal research, content analysis is a methodological and unbiased approach to the

examination of written, verbal, or visual material in order to derive conclusions and gain insight into legal issues, trends, or patterns within a particular context. It is a valuable research technique that is extensively employed by legal scholars, researchers, and practitioners to investigate a variety of legal materials, including legal documents, court cases, legislation, and regulations.

Also, in public health research, the black-letter methodology can be utilized for analyzing and understanding the legal determinants of public health practices. It includes: (i) Identification of relevant legal texts: This covers statutes, regulations, case law, and legal commentaries relevant to the public health issue under study; (ii) Systematic analysis: Detailed examination of the legal texts to identify key provisions, principles, and interpretations; (iii) Contextual interpretation: Understanding the legal texts within the broader socio-political and economic context; (iv) Impact assessment: Evaluating the implications of the legal texts on public health outcomes. (6, 7)

STRENGTHS AND LIMITATIONS OF THE BLACK-LETTER METHODOLOGY

The black-letter methodology is characterized by the detailed examination of legal texts, such as statutes, regulations, case law, legal treatises, and commentaries, in order to derive insights and draw conclusions. It provides invaluable insights into legal doctrines, legal systems, and legal reasoning, thereby making a substantial contribution to the advancement of legal theory and practice, the development of legal principles, and legal scholarship. (4, 6)

Strengths

The black-letter methodology has several advantages, especially in providing clarity and predictability within the legal matters and provisions of a system: (i) Clarity and certainty: The black-letter methodology emphasizes the importance of clear and well-defined laws. This ensures that individuals and entities can understand the legal implications of their actions, leading to greater compliance and fewer legal disputes. (ii) Predictability: By focusing on established legal principles and statutes, this methodology allows for more predictable outcomes in legal cases. This predictability is crucial for individuals and businesses to plan their activities within the legal framework. (iii) Efficiency: A black-letter methodology streamlines the legal process by reducing the need for extensive interpretation and debate over the meaning of laws. This can lead to quicker resolutions of legal issues and lower legal costs. (iv) Consistency: This methodology promotes consistency in legal decisions, as judges and lawyers rely on the same set of established rules and principles. Consistency is important for

maintaining fairness and equality before the law. (v) Legal Stability: By adhering to established laws and precedents, the black-letter methodology contributes to the stability of the legal system. This stability is essential for maintaining public trust and confidence in the legal system. (vi) Limitation of judicial discretion: The black-letter methodology limits the scope of judicial discretion, ensuring that judges do not deviate significantly from established laws. This can prevent arbitrary or biased decisions and uphold the rule of law. (vii) Alignment with codified laws: In areas where laws are codified, such as the criminal code in Nepal, the black-letter methodology ensures that individuals are only punished for actions that are clearly defined as crimes. This prevents retroactive punishment and upholds the principle of legality.

Limitations

The black letter methodology, which focuses on the literal interpretation of legal texts, can lead to a narrow understanding of the law and overlooks broader context and underlying principles. It can restrict the context to equip students with practical application skills, limiting their understanding of legal principles. The black-letter methodology is a limited approach to legal analysis due to its inability to adapt to changing legal systems. It may force the learners to memorize large amounts of facts and exceptions related to laws, which lacks depth in teaching students how to apply their knowledge.

APPLICATIONS OF THE BLACK-LETTER METHODOLOGY IN PUBLIC HEALTH

The black-letter methodology, traditionally used in legal research, has also been found to be applicable to public health research. It is the most appropriate research methodology for comparative studies, historical research, and jurisprudential research. (4, 7) This methodology focuses on the analysis of existing laws, regulations, and case law to understand their implications and effectiveness. To support this viewpoint, some of examples of applications of black-letter methodology in public health research are presented in this section.

Addressing anti-black racism in public health: A study analyzed legal frameworks and policies addressing anti-black racism within public health systems in North America. The study followed a structured approach to identify relevant laws and assess their impact on public health outcomes. (8)

Doctrinal legal method in health law: This method has been applied to explore the assumptions, commitments, and shortcomings of health laws. Researchers have used it to critically analyze the legal texts and their practical implications in public health. (9)

Guidance on reporting race and ethnicity: The methodology has been employed to review and provide updated guidance on the reporting of race and ethnicity in medical and science journals. This includes analyzing existing guidelines and their application in public health research. (10)

We can apply the black-letter methodology in public health research in various ways: (i) The black-letter methodology, which emphasizes analyzing legal rules and authorities, can be applied in public health research to examine and interpret health laws and regulations; (ii) Researchers can use this approach to understand the legal context surrounding public health issues, identify relevant legal provisions, and analyze how these laws impact public health practices and policies; (iii) By applying the skills of legal research such as identifying legal issues, analyzing legal provisions, and presenting research findings, researchers can contribute to the understanding of the legal framework governing public health initiatives and interventions; and (iv) The black-letter methodology can help in evaluating the effectiveness of public health laws, suggesting improvements for legal frameworks, and providing recommendations for enhancing public health outcomes through legal means.

To illustrate the application of the black-letter methodology in public health, we can consider the analysis of tobacco control laws. By systematically examining the legal texts related to tobacco regulation, researchers can assess the effectiveness of these laws in reducing smoking rates and improving public health. This approach can also identify gaps in the legal framework and suggest areas for reform.

IMPLICATIONS OF BLACK-LETTER METHODOLOGY IN PUBLIC HEALTH RESEARCH

The black-letter methodology provides a rigorous framework for analyzing the legal determinants of health. It allows researchers to systematically assess the impact of laws and regulations on public health outcomes. Public health research in Nepal, as in many other developing and developed countries, is predominantly focused on epidemiological and social research methodologies. These methodologies are integral to understanding and addressing the multifaceted health challenges faced by populations. However, there is a notable gap in the inclusion of legal research methodologies, particularly black-letter methodology, in public health research curricula and practice. It is therefore essential to incorporate black-letter methodology or doctrinal research in public health research for several reasons:

(i) Studying the legal determinants of public health

Understanding the legal determinants of public health is crucial for comprehensively addressing health disparities and promoting health equity. Legal determinants encompass the laws, regulations, and policies that influence health outcomes and access to healthcare services. By applying the black-letter methodology, public health researchers can systematically examine these legal determinants to identify how they impact various populations, particularly marginalized and vulnerable groups. This analysis can reveal legal barriers to health, such as discriminatory laws or inadequate legal protections, and provide evidence for advocating necessary legal reforms. Moreover, studying legal determinants helps in understanding the broader social determinants of health, as legal frameworks often shape social conditions like housing, employment, and education. Integrating this perspective into public health research ensures that interventions are not only scientifically sound but also legally and socially just, ultimately leading to more effective and equitable public health strategies.

(ii) Bridging the gap between law and public health

The black-letter methodology involves the systematic analysis of legal texts, statutes, and case law. Public health is inherently interdisciplinary, and legal frameworks play a crucial role in shaping health policies, regulations, and interventions. By incorporating the black-letter methodology, public health researchers can critically analyze existing laws and policies, identify legal gaps, and propose evidence-based legal reforms to enhance public health outcomes.

(iii) Enhancing policy development and implementation

Effective public health policies require a robust legal foundation. The black-letter research can provide a detailed understanding of the legal context within which public health operates. This understanding is essential for developing policies that are not only scientifically sound but also legally enforceable and sustainable. By integrating the black-letter methodology into public health research, scholars can contribute to the creation of comprehensive policies that address both health and legal considerations.

(iv) Addressing emerging public health challenges

The dynamic nature of public health challenges, such as pandemics, environmental health issues, and non-communicable diseases, necessitates a flexible and responsive legal framework. The black-letter research can help identify legal precedents and frameworks that have been effective in other contexts, facilitating the adaptation of these frameworks to address new

and emerging health threats. This proactive approach can enhance the preparedness and resilience of public health systems.

(v) Promoting interdisciplinary collaboration

Incorporating black-letter methodology into public health research fosters interdisciplinary collaboration between public health professionals and legal experts. This collaboration can lead to a more holistic understanding of health issues and the development of innovative solutions that are informed by both public health science and legal principles. Such interdisciplinary efforts are crucial for addressing complex health challenges that require multifaceted approaches.

(vi) Strengthening public health education

The incorporation of the black-letter methodology in public health curricula can enrich the educational experience of public health students. It equips them with the skills to critically analyze legal documents, understand the legal implications of public health interventions, and advocate for legal reforms that promote health equity and justice. This kind of integrated education prepares future public health professionals to navigate the legal dimensions of their work effectively.

CONCLUSION

The black-letter methodology offers valuable insights into the legal determinants of health. By systematically analyzing legal texts, public health researchers can better understand the impact of laws and regulations on health outcomes. This methodology can inform evidence-based policy development and contribute to more effective public health interventions. The integration of black-letter methodology into public health research is not merely an academic exercise but a practical necessity. It bridges the gap between law and public health, enhances policy development, addresses emerging challenges, promotes interdisciplinary collaboration, and strengthens public health education.

As a faculty member in public health, advocating for the incorporation of black-letter methodology in research and curricula is a step towards more comprehensive and effective public health research and practices.

REFERENCES

1. Academic Programs | CDPH-TU [Internet]. Cdph.tu.edu.np. 2020 [cited 2024 Aug 15]. Available from: <https://cdph.tu.edu.np/courses>
2. Nelson B. The Depiction of Unwritten Law. 2016.
3. Legrand P. Jameses at play: a tractation on the comparison of laws. *The American Journal of Comparative Law*. 2017 Jul 1;65(suppl_1):1-32.
4. Archive, V. (n.d.). Doctrinal Legal Research – Jusfocus Research Institute. Retrieved from <http://jusfocus.com/doctrinal-legal-research/>
5. blackletter law [Internet]. LII / Legal Information Institute. 2020 [cited 2024 Aug 16]. Available from: https://www.law.cornell.edu/wex/blackletter_law#
6. McConville M. *Research Methods for Law*. Edinburgh University Press; 2017.
7. Canuel ET. *Comparative Commercial Law: Methodologies, Black Letter Law and Law-in-Action*. NJCL. 2012;ii.
8. Flanagan A, Frey T, Christiansen SL, AMA Manual of Style Committee. Updated guidance on the reporting of race and ethnicity in medical and science journals. *Jama*. 2021 Aug 17;326(7):621-7.
9. Kilcommins S. Doctrinal legal method (Black Letterism): assumptions, commitments and shortcomings.
10. Rakotovo L, Simeoni M, Bennett-AbuAyyash C, Walji T, Abdi S. Addressing anti-Black racism within public health in North America: a scoping review. *International Journal for Equity in Health*. 2024 Jun 28;23(1):128.